Linguistic Landscape of Hong Kong 2019-20 Protests: A mediated Discourse Analysis of Political Graffiti

Milos Moskovljevic^{1,*},

¹Department of Media and Communication, City University of Hong Kong, 999077 Hong Kong SAR China; E-Mail: <u>mmoskovlj2-c@my.cityu.edu.hk; milosmoskov995@gmail.com</u>

Abstract

From 2019 to 2020, Hong Kong faced public unrest due to the Anti-Extradition Bill Movement. Political graffiti became a prevalent way to express dissent and different perspectives. This study uses linguistic landscape theory to examine the sociolinguistic and political characteristics of the graffiti that emerged during the protests. The goal is to highlight the counter-narratives that developed during this time. The findings, based on primary data (photos of graffiti) and secondary data (newspaper reports and social media posts on graffiti) collected from August 2019 to February 2020, suggest that protesters aimed to push forward the discourse on Hong Kong as a global economic hub that is succumbing to 'mainlandization.' As a result, much of the graffiti was written in English and other global languages. Although many of these messages were insightful and timely, some promoted radical ideas.

Keywords

contentious politics; political graffiti; alternative media; Hong Kong: Anti-Extradition Bill Movement; Linguistic Landscape; Mediated Discourse Analysis (MDA)

1. Introduction

Throughout 2019, citizens (and visitors) of one of the global economic hubs, Hong Kong, had the opportunity to witness explosive episodes of civil unrest regularly. A series of protest marches, clashes with the police, and other forms of civil disobedience have become an everyday reality for Hong Kongers. These protests - also known as The Anti-Extradition Bill Protests, were one of the global media events that marked that particular year - according to some reports, it was one of the most streamed events in the previous decade (Hui, 2019). In addition, streaming mobile technologies seem to have been key drivers behind the mediatization of the protests mentioned above. As Fang (2022) concludes in the extensive study that proposes an innovative socio-technological framework for analyzing the use of digital media by social movement, employing the example of the Hong Kong protests, mobile live streaming technology is vital " in encouraging the emotional involvement of the audiences. Interactive features, including emoji reactions and live comments, further facilitate affective participation, which co-produces the final product of this new journalistic format. " (p. 9). In other words, online and mobile streaming helps push narratives recounted by the social movement members and civic journalists into the streams of consciousness of the general public.

In line with this, it is essential to mention one recent scientific inquiry that illuminates mechanisms behind people acquiring political information from social media and alternative media and the consequent influences on social movement participation (Shen et al., 2020). According to the findings, those who get their information from social media and alternative media are more likely to participate in activities organized by social movements, notably compared to those who rely solely on traditional news sources. Furthermore, social media serves as an echo chamber since people are exposed to identical or similar sentiments, which can further encourage them to participate in a movement - particularly if they sense solid public approval towards the movement's actions. However, on the flip side, alternative media operates more as an intensifier of pre-existing (individual political) attitudes. In other words, if someone is already inclined to support a particular cause, alternative media can help boost their motivation to get involved. Overall, these findings suggest that how people consume political information can significantly impact their willingness to engage in social movements. We should be aware of these dynamics when trying to explore the mobilizing trajectories and consequent effects of them on people and further social shiftings around a particular cause and social movement.

Nevertheless, as it has been pointed out by Kraidy (2013), we must be aware that there is a significant problem with current academic research on contentious communication practices. The focus is often on platforms rather than processes, which reduces the idea of 'communication' to 'media.' This is a serious omission in the context of studies on social uprisings and movements, as it ushers to a disinterestedness towards "old" media, such as poetry, graffiti, and chants. It is essential to recognize that all revolutionary episodes in the 21st century are hypermedia events to some extent, as they are built upon various media platforms - and not necessarily just the ones in the virtual spheres. These platforms include virtual and material, global and local, and new and old media (Kraidy & Mourad, 2010; Kraidy, 2013). In a sense, the corpus of studies dealing with alternative media in the context of social movements seems to suffer from a similar problem - the focus seems to be mostly shifting to online alternative news outlets. In contrast, offline alternative media seem to be somewhat neglected.

One of the offline alternative media that was quite present in the repertoire of the Anti-Extradition Bill Movement is graffiti and various forms of street art. The walls in the public space would be decorated with thousands and thousands of fresh graffiti of diverse contents every day. Although the city authorities tried diligently to remove them, it was almost impossible for them to keep up the steps with the insurgents who created them at lightning speed. This article aims, by following the linguistic landscape theoretical framework, to investigate which socio-linguistic and political properties could be assigned to the language utilized in graffiti writings and which counternarratives were produced during the protests. In the first section of the paper, an overview of the literature related to graffiti as an alternative media and means of contentious politics will be presented, with a review of concepts and studies relevant to our theoretical framework - linguistic landscapes (during political rebellions/protests). After that, we will deal with clarifying the context in which our study was created, along with explaining the methodology we were guided by. Finally, readers will be introduced to the results of our research and provided with their explanation and proposals for possible future directions of study.

2. Political graffiti: Alternative mediums and means of contentious politics

We are witnessing political contestation in all spheres of life - as well as at all levels: from the street to high institutions. The previous decade, i.e., the period from 2010 to 2020, was marked as "the most contentious decade" in the previous 120 years. It seems that the activities of political contestation are just building their momentum - that is, the upcoming decade could be even more colorful and vigorous in terms of these activities (Abrams et al., 2022). By political contestation, we could refer to all those "[collective] interactions in which actors make claims bearing on someone else's interests, in which governments appear either as targets, initiators of claims or third parties." (Tilly, 2008, p. 5).

On the trail of this, one of the most common weapons choices through which self-expression is realized (whether we are talking about cultural identity, political commitment, and/or social affiliation) are graffiti and street art. Namely, as Mitja Velikonja (2019) noted, walls (and graffiti tags, auth. note) existed long before personal walls/feeds (and hashtags, auth. note) on digital social networks, such as Facebook. Street art and graffiti tags are usually among the first recipients of our attention when we enter into an urban environment (see Wang & Pomplun, 2012; Mitschke et al., 2017). Furthermore, as a kind of technology of political self-mediation, they cohabit with other political means - that is, they are often complimentary with them. In short, they are direct visual indicators of the cultural state in a political commune: We can asses them as a litmus paper that unravels and reveals the structure and dynamics of power relations. Graffiti tagging can be a very effective practice as it forces eyewitnesses to think and critically observe reality, ultimately leading to social engagement and action (Lévi-Strauss, 1971; Velikonja, 2019).

Furthermore, what is important to emphasize is that graffiti writing represents one of the most essential tools from the assortment of alternative media. Under the concept of "alternative media," in the context of this paper, we operate with the concept of 'alternative media' as 'critical media' developed by Christian Fuchs (2010). Alternative media represent "mass media that challenge the dominant forms of media production, media structures, content, distribution, and reception" (Fuchs, 2010, p. 178). Alternative media are divergent from the mainstream media because (1) ordinary citizens have the roles of both consumers and producers; (2) content is not being defined by it is sell-ability, and it is challenging dominant heteronomous perspectives; (3) citizens are organized on the principles of grassroots democracy - there are not any authorities, power is being symmetrically distributed, and usually decision-making is based on a consensus among those involved in content creation. According to Downing (2003), alternative media have colossal prospects to exhilarate public debate since they are not just any media but also the 'media embedded in society.' In that sense, alternative media stimulate partisanship for oppressed and marginalized individuals and collectives.

We should bear in mind that the general audience takes the majority of their news from media that is considered mainstream. However, in times of social uprising, messages being broadcasted through alternative media find their way to mainstream media, thus implying the ongoing convergence between alternative and mainstream media (Bailey et al., 2008) – which was the case in the Hong Kong protests. As can be expected, such development is primarily due to the rise of electronic media and informationcommunication technologies since they alter private and public spaces by transforming them and the existing boundaries between them. Communication via electronic media relies on the totalization of information access and propagation, leading to the erosion of normative conceptions of authority (Meyrowitz, 1986). Through electronic devices and, thus, various digital tools, different publics have been allowed to increase their presence in public life since mediated communication removes the notion of physicality from the presence. Consequently, in an academic inquiry on alternative media, physical and digital spaces should be treated as two interdependent realms or as "co-constitutive which minimizes a range of existing dualisms between 'online' and 'offline' and between 'public sphere' and 'public sphere'" (Willems, 2019 p. 1194). Such intersected sequence is apparent in political communication carried by urban social movements since "streets, and the screens [...] are distinct spaces for public action, but actions undertaken through these distinct spaces took shape in close relation to one another" (Iveson, 2007, p. 13).

Graffiti has become a potent means of mass communication in urban environments with limited access to mainstream information channels. Political activists, dissidents, and rebels often resort to such a way of interaction because they cannot communicate in socially acceptable ways, and they feel the need to express their views and rooted values - even if they do it through writing and spraying on public social surfaces (Zaimakis, 2015; Tunali, 2021; Miladi, 2018). Although from a reactionary point of view, graffiti is seen as an act of vandalism (Velikonja, 2019) - it should not be condemned in advance without further contextualization. Namely, they, as a particular mode of communication, enable individuals to get to know their social environment better, with their identity, needs, and values - which often deviate from the established norms within that same environment. Therefore, graffiti writing activities can also be seen as a holler for individuals to connect (that is, to find) their likeminded people. Finally, as Baudrillard (1994) observes, the only authentic medium of mass communication is the street - the living space of graffiti. Therefore, altering the streetscape reflects on the digital environment (and vice versa) - which brings us to the next question, which is the question of the so-called linguistic landscape in material (and digital!) space during the Anti-Extradition Bill Protests 2019.

3. Political graffiti: Markers of political boundaries and identification in the linguistic landscape Graffiti, as a unique form of street art, is often seen as transgressive writing on public or street walls. It is also "because they are not authorized, and they may even be prohibited by some social or legal institutions" (Scollon & Scollon, 2003, p. 151). Furthermore, as transgressive gestures of communication - we can anticipate finding them in the most unusual places - especially those that are, in a certain sense, meaningful for authority figures. Graffiti artists persist in conquering those spaces that were not given to them, and graffiti as a "transgressive global art" calls for reckoning with the authorities and crumpling the status quo (see Campos, 2015; Velikonja, 2019). Furthermore, although spraying graffiti is often written off as an insignificant convention, that is, as a kind of youthful provocation and everyday triviality - it is not out of place, like Mitja Velikonja, to ask the question: if graffiti are harmless, and especially graffiti that bear a political connotation: then why they get removed? Graffiti seems to be, in fact, terrifying for those in power: their potential impact is inversely proportional to their duration on the walls. Admittedly, we must also bear in mind that political graffiti can sometimes be misused by different political actors to manipulate public opinion and impose problematic sentiments regarding collective memory on regular citizens (Moskovljevic, 2022).

Furthermore, graffiti writing is an art form that allows individuals to express their personal and collective identities through visual means, utilizing a variety of mediums and technologies. The multi-layered nature of graffiti is apparent in both its physical and symbolic aspects during its creation and interpretation. Whether one is creating or observing graffiti, individuals contribute to the ongoing narrative and leave their own unique imprint on the mental canvas. This art form provides a platform for self-expression and communication that transcends traditional boundaries, making it an important form of contemporary art. In other words, graffiti writings could be assessed as urban and political palimpsests (Myllylä, 2018). At the same time, the street itself, alongside the urban commons and architecture, could be seen as a palimpsest as well (Engbersen, 2001). One of the approaches that seems to be adequate when solving such complexity is the so-called Language Landscape(LL) framework. As Landry and Bourhis have written: "The linguistic landscape is concerned with the issue of language in the written form in the public sphere.

It is the language of public road signs, advertising billboards, street names, place names, commercial shop signs, and public signs on government buildings combined to form the linguistic landscape of a given territory, region or urban agglomeration" (1997, p. 205). Before delving into the rationale for this approach and the details of our methodology, it is necessary to point out a few more details regarding the practice of graffiti writing in East Asia. We must emphasize that the ways of information circulation - including graffiti - in East Asian societies are embedded in the local cultural and social milieu. When it comes to graffiti and street art, it should be noted that painting or leaving written messages in public spaces is traditionally associated with the manifestation of power in China. Pan (2014) describes how "open-space writing by authority has long been part of the aesthetic tradition in the Chinese cultural context" (p. 136). Thus, for example, during recent protests, graffiti were used as a discursive practice that sought to draw demarcation lines between natives and invasive settlers - Mainlanders (Lowe & Ortmann, 2020).

Some authors suggest they could be seen as harbingers of "a resurgence of nativism among Hong Kong youth who are resisting the Chinese encroachment" (p. 413). "Given the political and identitarian characteristics of some of the graffiti in Hong Kong, imaginative geographies challenge Beijing's authoritatively imposed cartography of the SAR as inalienable "(Lowe & Ortmann, 2022, p. 9). The political control exerted by the Chinese government since 1997, according to some scholars (ibid.), has given rise to a nativist discourse in Hong Kong. Mainland immigrants, tourists, and traders are frequently depicted as harmful entities, likened to locusts. This kind of rhetoric has sparked moral distress and unease regarding cross-border births (Huang et al., 2019), and it is also present in graffiti imaginery (Lowe & Ortmann, 2020; Lowe & Ortmann, 2022). Consequently, we will stick to labelling graffiti as a means of political contestation, but we are not sure if we can necessarily attach the quality of democracy to them. Democracy implies political tolerance towards Others (den Berghe, 2002), and we should not forget that.

4. Methodology and research questions

During the recent Hong Kong 2019 protests, there has been a collision between the public and counter-public spheres. This collision has led to the emergence of alternative media messages proliferation. These messages have been simultaneously disseminated through digital tools such as online discussion boards (Leung, Hsiao & Garimella, 2022; Lee et al., 2022), or through the synergy of instamessaging apps and embodied media arts (Cheng, 2022) which has been helpful in hacking the mainstream media logic and getting protester's counter-narratives reach wider audiences: not just in Hong Kong, but on a global scale as well. As a result, it is imperative to investigate all of the intricate communication dynamics that are inherent to social movements; in this sense, the rapidly developing science of graffitology holds great promise. This multidisciplinary field of study explores the influence of street graffiti inscriptions' visual ideas on modern society. Graffitology, which is similar to participant observation, is a powerful tool for understanding social movements through the gathering of images of street art and graffiti (see Velikonja, 2019). With a focus on graffiti that contains distinct semantic meanings through verbal or graphical aspects, we have put together a modest selection of images depicting graffiti painted by the Hong Kong protestors throughout the riots.

The images in our collection were shot in Hong Kong's metropolitan districts between August 2019 and February 2020, which is a crucial detail to note. The *City University of Hong Kong* campus was one of our main lodging spots; readers should keep in mind that university campuses have frequently served as epicenters for politicized activities started by protestors (which is not surprising, as a considerable part of them were students - author's note). Even though radical actions somewhat hit the

Polytechnic University and Chinese University of Hong Kong's grounds, we were unable to enter those grounds. Besides the scenery on and around the (CityU) campus, as mentioned earlier, we have also gathered photographs from Nathan Road (one of the main thoroughfares in Hong Kong) and the Central. However, the information gathered is representative enough to make some judgments on the usage of graffiti. Questions about the nature of the writing itself, its placement, and its context influenced our examination of graffiti.

In our research, we relied on the studies of Landry and Borhhuis (1997) and Seloni and Sarfati (2017), which concern the linguistic landscape. In their study, Landry and Borhuis (1997) established two important functions of LL: a) informational function; b) symbolic function. Understanding the linguistic composition of a specific region can reveal valuable insights into the diversity and cultural dynamics of the area. By identifying the various languages spoken or being used by different groups and analyzing their prevalence, we can gain a deeper understanding of the relationships between the communities inhabiting that territory. This information helps us appreciate the unique characteristics of each linguistic group and the factors that shape their interactions with one another. In other words "the predominance of one language on public signs relative to the other languages can relect the relative power and status of competing language groups" (Landry and Bourhis 1997, 26). Conversely, the symbolic function may explain how a group's social identity and its position and power are influenced by the language used in public signs, whether it is present or absent.

Next, as per Seloni and Sarfati sudy on Linguistic Landscape of Gezi Park protests (2017) our principal approach to studying graffiti and street art is informed by the principles of Mediated Discourse Analysis (MDA), which draws on critical discourse analysis, interactional sociolinguistics ethnography, and Faircloughian Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA). MDA is specifically concerned with social action rather than discourse itself, and while it acknowledges the dialogic nature of texts, it also examines how past events and objects are represented in different semiotic systems and their materialities, a process known as resemiotization. In this framework, discourse is viewed as a social practice, and the aim is to comprehend how language is utilized to effect concrete social actions and how social structures and ideologies are produced and reproduced through these actions. Therefore, in mediated discourse analysis, the analysis is not restricted to the texts alone, but also encompasses the actions that surround them. Our examination of graffiti and street art during the uprising takes into consideration the cultural tools and texts that were produced, as well as the diverse social actions that were intertwined with them - both offline and online. In our comprehensive research on graffiti, we delved into a variety of sources to gain a nuanced understanding. Alongside primary sources such as photographs, we also delved into secondary sources, such as depictions of graffiti in daily newspapers and popular social media platforms like Instagram or Reddit. This multifaceted approach allowed us to gain a deeper insight into the various forms and contexts of graffiti use during Hong Kong 2019 protests. At last, by utilizing MDA, we believed that we would be able to gain a more comprehensive understanding of how social actors exercise their agency through various mediated actions in combination with graffiti spraying. During our study, we aimed to answer, firstly, what are the indexical properties associated with the graffiti we examined, and what do these properties signify for the protesters, authorities, and the general audience? And secondly, what are the political narratives conveyed through the graffiti inscriptions?

5. Findings and discussion

Public areas in the lively metropolis of Hong Kong are dominated by billboards, digital displays, and commercial ads, making it difficult for other types of visual art to draw in onlookers. (Political) Graffiti, on the other hand, has become a popular and obvious form of expression throughout these recent protests, with new graphic works sprouting on a daily basis. These pieces of contentious art could have be seen in a variety of public spaces, such as government buildings, college campuses, asphalt streets, and building facades. Nathan Road, a long and broad thoroughfare that frequently turned into a battleground between demonstrators and police, was one of the most



Figure 1. Graffiti tags on concrete barrier in Nathan Road. From private archive of the author.

fascinating places where one could encounter hundreds of graffiti every day. The graffiti would be written on concrete slabs located in the middle of the road. (Figure 1). The concrete traffic barrier occupying the middle of the road was covered in political messages in the form of graffiti, creating a dynamic and ever-changing landscape that reflected the intense emotions of the protesters. Moreover, it is intriguing to note that certain graffiti tags were found on the asphalt, which is a rather unusual sight, particularly when we analyze the trends of protests globally. Normally, graffiti are restricted to walls as per the unwritten norms. This observation leads us to question the motives and methods of the individuals behind these tags, as it defines the established graffiti culture (Figure 1 & 2).



Figure 2. Graffiti tag on asphalt – Nathan Road. From private archive of the author.



Figure 3. Graffiti writings on the cross-walk, Nathan Road. From private archive of the author.

The smooth functioning of urban areas heavily relies on transportation infrastructure. Unfortunately, insurgents often target key facilities such as bus and tram stations, as well assubwaystations, which leads to disruptions in people's daily routine. The Anti-Extradition Bill Protests were not an exception, as the rebels caused traffic disruptions and left behind written evidence of their presence in those areas. Traffic junctions, including bus and tram stops, metro stations, and footbridges (Figure 4) were frequently targeted by the rebels due to their strategic importance. Public transport is relied upon by many individuals, so inscriptions in these locations are more likely to draw attention from passers-by. Even crosswalks were used as a canvas for political messaging, as depicted in Figure 3.



Though they may seem unrelated, global businesses like Starbucks, Yoshinoya, and Activision Blizzard have become the focus of political tension in Hong Kong. Some pro-democracy protesters and their allies have assessed these companies as supporters of the Chinese Communist Party in Beijing, making them targets for boycotts or even vandalism. Using mobile apps and websites, protesters would share information about the companies' alleged ties to China, often based on rumors or comments made by executives or their family members. For instance, Starbucks and Yoshinoya have faced repeated backlash due to their Hong Kong franchise owner, while Activision Blizzard has been boycotted for attempting to censor a pro-democracy player (Wong, 2019). In other words, besides traffic conjunctions, Universities, and public buildings; commercial shops were also targeted and sprayed by protesters (Figure 4 & Figure 5 & Figure 6).

Figure 4. Footbridge nearby City University of Hong Kong and MTR station. From private archive of the author.



Figure 5. Graffiti tags over commercial space – Central, Hong Kong. From private archive of the author.



Figure 6. Graffiti tags over student dorm walls, City University of Hong Kong. From private archive of the author.



Figure 7. "Yuen Long" graffiti. Retrieved from open source https://languagelog.ldc.upenn.edu/nll/?p=43767

As it goes for their linguistic qualities, political graffiti messages were commonly scrawled in Cantonese and English. Despite the prospect of miswritten Chinese characters, demonstrators would invoke some amusing linguistic incidents due to the prioritized efficiency of their statements as a persuasive political instrument. Miswritten Chinese characters on John Lennon's walls and political graffiti have been a source of humor, as chronicled in several blogs and newspaper vestibules. Miswritten characters are sometimes the consequence of a single missed stroke, while other times, a character with the same Cantonese sound is utilized wrongly. For example, "Revenge for Yuen Long" (Figure 7) alluded to an event in which white-clad men with apparent triad ties attacked demonstrators and onlookers. Interestingly, although being spelled differently, the Cantonese words for concern and revenge sound the same.

Furthermore, the choice of English language is not random - throughout Hong Kong's history, English has been considered a prestige language, closely connected with better education, greater social standing, intellect, and money. Before the change in sovereignty in 1997, English was the working language of the formal institutions of government, law, education, and international commerce.

" English would form a vital and highly visible component in the LL of Hong Kong SAR, functioning not as a last vestige of past colonial history, or solely as an international language of commerce and business, but more significantly as a vital marker of 'two systems' that differentiates Hong Kong from other cities of the PRC." (Lai, 2013, p. 252). By insisting on the English language use in the graffiti writings, it seems that the protesters were trying to keep the paradigm of Hong Kong as a global economic center alive. This narrative is further strengthened by the use of quotes and memetic symbols from the global (Internet) culture - such as Pepe the Frog (see Figure 8) or famous movie quotes (Figure 9). They would also try to call upon the remembrance of previous protests - by using symbols related to the past events, such as Umbrellas or Yellow Jackets which refer to the 2014 protests (Figure 5 & Figure 10).



Figure 8. Pepe the Frog on Hong Kong streets. Retreived from open source <u>https://www.reddit.com/r/</u> <u>PewdiepieSubmissions/comments/dei8kj/pepe_the_frog_graffiti_found_on_the_streets_of/</u>



Figure 9. Elements of Global Culture in Graffiti Tags, Hong Kong Central. Private archive of the author.



Figure 10. Graffiti refering to 2014 protests, nearby Nathan Road. Private archive of the author.

In some cases, graffiti would be informative—for example, they were used to inform the government and the general public of protestors' five demands: (1) full withdrawal of controversial bill from the legislative body; (2) establishment of an independent commission of inquiry into alleged cases of police brutality; (3) banishing the classification of protesters as "rioters" in public language; (4) full amnesty for all arrested protesters; (5) implementation of dual universal suffrage (see Figure 6). Yet, there were cases where, besides being critical of the Carrie' Lam's government and police brutality (see Figure 4 & 5) – graffiti tags would rely on the use of offensive language, For instance, police forces would be tagged as "popo" or as "black cops" (*haak ging* in Cantonese), which was a way to refer to the corrupted law enforcement.

6. Conclusions

The Anti-Extradition Bill Movement caused widespread discontent in Hong Kong from 2019 to 2020. Political graffiti have become a popular means to express protest and diverse points of view. This research uses linguistic landscape theory to investigate graffiti's sociolinguistic and political aspects. The idea was to emphasize the counter-narratives that emerged throughout this time period by relying on the mediation discourse analysis. Based on primary data (photos of graffiti) and secondary data (newspaper reports and social media posts about graffiti) collected from August 2019 to February 2020, the findings suggest that protesters aimed to advance the discourse on Hong Kong as a global economic hub that is succumbing to 'mainlandization.' As a result, a large portion of the graffiti was scrawled in English and other worldwide languages.

Despite the challenges of competing with commercial imagery that dominates Hong Kong's public spaces, graffiti has become a powerful and impactful form of expression during the 2019 protests. Through bold colors, striking imagery, and political messages, graffiti artists have been able to convey their message to a broader audience - not just locally, but on a global scale as well. The emergence of graffiti as a form of protest art in Hong Kong is a testament to the power of art in catalyzing social movements and creating a diverse public discourse. Future research should tackle the interconnectedness between Internet memes and graffiti writings – as a lot of memetic symbols were utilized in the graffiti themselves.

References

Abrams, B., Travaglino, G. A., Gardner, P. R., & Callan, B. 2022. The Meaning of Contention. Contention, 10(2), 83-101. Retrieved Nov 2, 2023, from <u>https://doi.org/10.3167/cont.2022.100205</u>

Bailey, O. G., Cammaerts, B., & Carpentier, N. (2008). Understanding alternative media. Open University Press. Baudrillard, J. (1994). Simulacra and simulation. University of Michigan press.

Campos, R. 2015. Youth, graffiti, and the aestheticization of transgression. Social Analysis, 59(3), 17-40.

Cheng, L. 2022. Media Arts as Political Advocacy in Hong Kong's Social Movements. In Global Media Arts Education: Mapping Global Perspectives of Media Arts in Education (pp. 25-41). Cham: Springer International Publishing.

Downing, J. D. 2003. Radical media and globalization. L. Artz & YR Kamalipour (Eds.). The globalization of corporate media hegemony, 283-293.

Engbersen,, G. 2001., The urban palimpsest. Focaal-European Journal of Anthropology, 38, 125-138.

Fang, K., 2023., The social movement was live streamed: a relational analysis of mobile live streaming during the 2019 Hong Kong protests. Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication, 28(1), <u>https://academic.oup.com/jcmc/</u> <u>article/28/1/zmac033/6880146</u>.

Fuchs, C., 2010., Alternative Media as Critical Media. European Journal of Social Theory, 13(2), 173–192.

Huang, T. Y. M., Woo, C. K., & Lai, Y. F. 2019. Imagining accidental fetal citizens: pregnant Mainland women and the cultural politics of birthright citizenship. Inter-Asia Cultural Studies, 20(1), 73-90.

Hui, M., 2019., The Hong Kong protests are the most livestreamed protests ever. Quartz, November 11, 2019, https://qz.com/1737197/hong-kong-protests-are-mostlive-streamed-ever.

raidy, M. M., 2013., The body as a medium in the digital age: Challenges and opportunities. Communication and Critical/ Cultural Studies, 10(2–3), 285–290.

Kraidy, M. M., & Mourad, S., 2010. Hypermedia space and global communication studies: Lessons from the Middle East. Global Media Journal, 8 (16), <u>https://repository.upenn.edu/asc_papers/248</u>.

Lai, M. L., 2013 The linguistic landscape of Hong Kong after

Landry, R., & Bourhis, R. Y. 1997. Linguistic landscape and ethnolinguistic vitality: An empirical study. Journal of language and social psychology, 16(1), 23-49.

Lee, F. L., Liang, H., Cheng, E. W., Tang, G. K., & Yuen, S., 2022. Affordances, movement dynamics, and a centralized digital communication platform in a networked movement. Information, Communication & Society, 25(12), 1699-1716.

Leung, B., Hsiao, Y., & Garimella, K., 2022. Decentralized yet unifying: Digital media and solidarity in Hong Kong's anti-Extradition movement. Journal of Quantitative Description: Digital Media, 2. <u>https://journalqd.org/article/view/2977</u>.

Lévi-Strauss, C. 1971. Totemism No. 157. Beacon Press.

Lowe, J., & Ortmann, S., 2020. Unmasking nativism in Asia's world city: graffiti and identity boundary un/making in Hong Kong. Continuum, 34(3), 398-416.

Lowe, J., & Ortmann, S., 2022. Graffiti of the "New" Hong Kong and Their Imaginative Geographies During the Anti-Extradition Bill Protests of 2019–2020. Critical Arts, 36(1-2), 1-19. Miladi, N. 2018., Urban graffiti, political activism and resistance. The Routledge Companion to Media and Activism, 241-249.

Ming, L., & Wang, G., 2022. An introduction to the special issue on "Language, Politics and Media: The Hong Kong protests. Journal of Language and Politics, 21(1), 1-16.

Mitschke, V., Goller, J., & Leder, H., 2017. Exploring everyday encounters with street art using a multimethod design. Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts, 11(3), 276.

Moskovljevic, M,. 2022. War on the walls. UXUC - User Experience and Urban Creativity, 4(1), 23 - 40.

Myllylä, M., 2018. Graffiti as a palimpsest. Street Art & Urban Creativity, 4(2), 25-35.

Pan, L. 2014. Writing at the end of history: reflections on two cases of graffiti in Hong Kong. Public Art Dialogue, 4(1), 147-166.

Scollon, R., & Scollon, S.B. 2003. Discourses in Place: Language in the Material World. Routledge.

Seloni, L., & Sarfati, Y., 2017. Linguistic landscape of Gezi Park protests in Turkey: A discourse analysis of graffiti. Journal of Language and Politics, 16(6), 782-808.

Shen, F., Xia, C., & Skoric, M., 2020. Examining the roles of social media and alternative media in social movement participation: A study of Hong Kong's Umbrella Movement. Telematics and Informatics, 47, <u>https://www.sciencedirect.</u> com/science/article/abs/pii/S0736585319307956

Tilly, C., 2008. Contentious performances. Cambridge University Press.

Tunali, T. 2021. Contemporary public art and dialectical aspects of the 'Democratization'of the urban public space. CAP-Public Art Journal, 3(2), 10-17.

Van den Berghe, P. L. 2002. Multicultural democracy: can it work?. Nations and Nationalism, 8(4), 433-449.

Velikonja, M., 2019. Post-socialist political graffiti in the Balkans and Central Europe. Routledge.

Wang, H. C., & Pomplun, M., 2012. The attraction of visual attention to texts in real-world. Journal of Vision, 12, <u>https://jov.arvojournals.org/article.aspx?articleid=2192308</u>.

Willems, W., 2019. 'The politics of things': Digital media, urban space, and the materiality of publics. Media, Culture & Society, 41(8), 1192–1209.

Wong, E., 2019. Hong Kong protesters are targeting Starbucks. Apple could be next. The New York Times, https://www.nytimes.com/2019/10/15/business/hong-kong-starbucks-vandalism.html.

Zaimakis, Y. 2015. 'Welcome to the civilization of fear': on political graffiti heterotopias in Greece in times of crisis. Visual Communication, 14(4), 373-396.